

Equal possibilities not restricted opportunity: A critical reflection on the experiences of ‘Vocational’ transition within the context of post-16 sports education

*Submitted by David Charles Rhys Aldous to the University of Exeter as a thesis for
the degree of Doctor of Philosophy by Research in Sport and Health Sciences,
December, 2010*

*This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no
quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.*

*I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no
material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other
university.*

..... David Charles Rhys Aldous

Abstract

This PhD study explores the transitional experiences of working class students between institutions of Further Education and Higher Education within the field of post-16 sports education. It draws its empirical illustration from the interview and ethnographic data collected over an 18 month period between October 2007 and July 2009 from a group of six students who had enrolled on a vocational FDS Sc Foundation Degree qualification. The study is comprised of two interrelated parts: Part I of the study illustrates the conceptual and methodological considerations which have driven the exploration of the student experience. The theoretical approach for investigating these experiences is informed by the structurationist perspective of Rob Stones (Stones, 2005). Stones conceptualises the relations between agent and structure four interlinked areas: External Structures, Internal Structures, Active Agency and Outcomes. Conceptualising transitional experience in this manner offers possibilities for a more contextually sensitive, refined, developed and ultimately adequate ontology of structuration. In further developing the framework, the study draws upon the sociological understanding of Basil Bernstein and Pierre Bourdieu. The incorporation of these two distinguishable but related perspectives allows the framework to inform an understanding of the interconnections between the sanctioned practices of a context, the role of agents within a context and the power capacities that are derived from these relations (Mouzelis, 1991; Morrison, 2005). In doing so, it provides a number of lenses in understanding the practices and relations between Further and Higher Education and the consequences of this for agents who enter this transition. Part II critically reflects on the participants experiences. Drawing upon data collected at three institutions: Hope Further Education College (HFEC), Fawltly University-College (FUC) and Ivory Tower University (ITU), the study discusses and explores in depth how the relations between the participants and the external structures of the institutions begin to form three identifiable and conceptually distinguishable transitional experiences which are seen to be either Empowering, Fragmented or Failed. In reflecting upon such relations and experiences, the study suggests that discourses of opportunity surrounding vocational qualifications forwarded to these students prior to, and during their course, is rather more complex than previously illustrated and for some functions as more of a myth than empowering discourse. Rather than providing equal possibility, the relations and transitional experiences that are currently produced only afford restricted opportunities to students choosing this vocational pathway within post-16 sports education. In conclusion, the study begins to discuss the implications of the relations and experiences highlighted for present and prospective relations and practices, asking whether change is possible, creating equal possibilities, not restricted opportunity.

Key Words: Structuration theory; Quadripartite Framework; Transitional experience; Further Education; Higher Education.

Contents.

<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Page Number</i>
<i>Abstract</i>	2
Chapter 1: Introduction	10
1.1 The emergence of Foundation Degrees	10
1.2 Understanding the vocational experience.	14
1.3 An overview of the PhD study	15
 Part One: The foundations and evolutions of thought: Literature Review and Methodology.	 19
 Chapter 2: Literature Review	 21
2.1. An overview of current and historical perspectives within Higher and Further Educational Research.	21
2.2. Addressing the individual experience: Micro Level perceptions of Higher Education	22
2.3. The contribution of structurationist perspectives to understanding structure-agent relations	27
2.4. Developing a structurationist perspective - The quadripartite framework .	29
2.4.1. <i>External structures</i>	30
2.4.2 <i>Internal structures</i>	32
2.4.3 <i>Active agency</i>	35
2.4.4 <i>Outcomes</i>	37
2.5. Developing understanding of agent-structure relations within post-16 education	39
2.6. The Contribution of Basil Bernstein's sociology of pedagogy in understanding structure-agent relations.	41
2.6.1. <i>The contribution of Bernstein's Theory of Pedagogic Discourse in understanding the construction and transmission of external structures.</i>	43
2.6.1.1. <i>Primary context.</i>	44
2.6.1.2. <i>Secondary context.</i>	46
2.6.1.3. <i>Recontextualising context.</i>	46

Chapter	Page Number
2.6.1.4. <i>Official Recontextualising Field (OPF).</i>	47
2.6.1.5. <i>Pedagogic Recontextualising Field (ORF).</i>	48
2.7. The concept of code.	52
2.8 Understanding the communication of external structures.	56
2.8.1. <i>Distributive rules</i>	57
2.8.2. <i>Recontextualising rules</i>	58
2.8.3. <i>Evaluative rules</i>	59
2.8.4. <i>Modification of the device</i>	60
2.9. The classification and framing of pedagogic relations and practices.	62
2.9.1 <i>Principle of classification</i>	63
2.9.2. <i>Principle of framing</i>	65
2.10. Reflection: Bernstein's contribution to a structurationist perspective.	67
2.10.1. <i>Integration of Bernstein's conceptual work into a structurationist framework.</i>	69
2.11 Developing understanding of the role of internal structures: The contribution of Pierre Bourdieu's reflexive sociology.	71
2.11.1 <i>Considering Bourdieu's concept of field in conceptualising external structures.</i>	73
2.11.2 <i>The role of Bourdieu's concept of habitus in understanding the role of internal structures within structure-agent relations.</i>	74
2.11.3. <i>The role of internal structures in shaping experiences of education.</i>	76
2.11.4 <i>Understanding the 'value' of external and internal structure relations through Bourdieu's concept of capital.</i>	79
2.11.4.1. <i>Social capital</i>	80
2.11.4.2. <i>Cultural capital</i>	81
2.11.4.3 <i>Physical capital</i>	82
2.12. Reflection of Bourdieu's contribution to the structurationist perspective	85
2.13. Towards a reflexive sociological understanding of transitional experience.	88
2.13.1 <i>The role of external structures (ES_m/ES_{is})</i>	89
2.13.2 <i>The role of internal structures (IS_{cd}/IS_{gd})</i>	92
2.13.3 <i>Active agency (Aa)</i>	93

<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Page Number</i>
2.13.4 Outcomes	95
2.13.5 Reflections and research foci	95
Chapter 3: Methodology	99
3.1. Some methodological considerations.	99
3.2. Reflection and consideration of the paradigmatic lenses.	101
3.3. Research Design	106
3.3.1. The agent-in-focus.	110
3.3.2. Data collection considerations.	111
3.4. The tools of data collection	114
3.4.1. Interviewing	115
3.4.2. The use of ethnography in forming an understanding of transitional experience.	120
3.4.3. A brief reflection on data collection techniques	123
3.5. Ethical considerations	125
3.6. Data analysis	129
3.6.1. Context analysis.	131
3.6.2. Conduct analysis.	133
3.6.3. Coding of data.	135
3.7. Representation of transitional experiences.	138
3.7.1. Modifying the realist tale.	140
3.7.2. Representational issues.	141
3.8. Considerations of the methodological approach	143
 PART II - TRANSITIONAL VOCATIONAL EXPERIENCES OF FDS _c to BSc Top Up Pathways	 146
Chapter 4: Shaping the transitional experience: A critical account of the relations within and between FDS_c-BSc Sport Qualifications.	148
4.1. The role of external structures (ES _m) in the creation of Foundation Degrees and Top-Up pathways.	148

<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Page Number</i>
<i>4.1.1. The role of government agencies in the construction of Foundation Degrees.</i>	<i>148</i>
<i>4.1.2. The role of the professional sports industry in the construction of Foundation Degrees.</i>	<i>149</i>
4.2. An example of the recontextualisation of Foundation Degrees: Hope College	152
4.3. The external structures of ‘Top Up’ institutions: The contexts of Fawltly Tower and Ivory Universities.	166
<i>4.3.1. Fawltly Tower University.</i>	<i>168</i>
<i>4.3.2. Transition into Ivory University.</i>	<i>174</i>
4.4. Reflections and possibilities.	178
 Chapter 5: The empowered transitional experience	 182
<i>5.1 An introduction to empowered agents: Jack and Emily</i>	<i>182</i>
<i>5.2. The empowered experience of Hope College.</i>	<i>187</i>
<i>5.3. Transformations within empowered transitional experiences.</i>	<i>193</i>
<i>5.4. Contrasting empowered experiences of a ‘Top Up’ year.</i>	<i>196</i>
<i>5.4.1 Challenging Embedded Social Positions through Empowered Practice.</i>	<i>200</i>
<i>5.4.2. The Fragility of Empowerment.</i>	<i>205</i>
5.5. Reflections on empowered experience.	208
 Chapter 6: The Fragmented Transitional Experience	 211
6.1. The creation of fragmented transitional experiences.	211
6.2. Promising beginnings: fragmented experiences of Hope College.	218
6.3. ‘Shutting up shop’: fragmented experiences at Fawltly Tower.	228
6.4. Reflections on the fragmented transition experience.	235
 Chapter 7: Failed Transition	 237
7.1. Prelude to a failed transitional experience.	237
7.2. Mythical investments within Hope College.	246

<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Page Number</i>
7.3. The signification of failed transitions.	258
7.4. Reflections on the failed transitional experience.	268
Chapter 8: Conclusion & Reflections	272
8.1. Towards a utopian vision of post-16 sports education.	273
8.2. Understanding transitional experience - some theoretical and methodological considerations.	275
8.3. Reflections on the relations between and within the institutions of post-16 sports education.	280
8.4. Reflections on the transitional experiences of agents within vocational qualifications.	286
8.5. Future research directions: implications for e practices and relations within the fields of post-16 sports education.	290
8.5.1. <i>Understanding and developing relations between institutions and professions (exploration of the external structures ESm).</i>	292
8.5.2. <i>Understanding and development of external structures in-situ (ESis).</i>	293
8.5.3. <i>Understanding of current agent practices (IScs)</i>	294
8.5.4. <i>Development of agent practice in line with previous experiences of students and practitioners (IScs/ISgd)</i>	295
8.6. Final thoughts.	296
Bibliography	298

Tables & Illustrations.		
Fig. 2.1	Diagram to illustrate elements of the quadripartite framework of structuration (Adapted from Stones, 2005)	p. 29
Fig. 2.2	Diagram to illustrate the social construction of discourse (Adapted from Bernstein, 1990)	p. 44
Fig. 2.3	Diagram to illustrate the three components of the pedagogic device (Adapted from Bernstein, 1990)	p. 56

Tables & Illustrations.		
Fig. 2.4	Diagram to illustrate the components of Pierre Bourdieu's Reflexive Sociology.	p. 71
Fig. 2.5	Diagram to illustrate the conceptualisation of transitional experience	p. 87
Fig. 2.6	Diagram to illustrate the role of external structures (ESm/ESis) within the construction of transitional experiences	p. 91
Fig. 2.7	Diagram to illustrate the role of internal structures (IScd/ISgd) within the construction of transitional experiences	p. 93
Fig. 2.8	Diagram to illustrate the social construction of active agency within transitional experience.	p. 94
Fig. 2.9	Diagram to illustrate the social construction of outcomes within transitional experience.	p. 96
Fig. 3.10.	Diagram to illustrate the research design timeline.	p. 106
Table 3.1	Components of the Case Study Research Design.	p. 130
Table 3.2	Process of coding of data.	p. 134
Table 4.0	Examples of competency practice within Hope Further Education College.	p. 150
Table 4.1	Examples of performativity practice within Fawltly Tower University and Ivory Tower University.	p.175
Fig. 8.0	Diagram to illustrate a development model of relations within the context of post-16 sports education transition between further and Higher Education	p.284
Fig. 8.1	Diagram to illustrate a development model of relations within the context of post-16 sports education transition between further and Higher Education	p. 291